Draft 5.2

Finding Common Threads:

Selected Summary of the Research on the Courage to Teach Program
and the Process of Teacher Formation

by Mike Poutiatine, Ph.D.

CONTENTS:

Selected Summary of the Research on the Courage to Teach Program
and the Process of Teacher Formation

Introduction: The Call for Courage in Teaching

       A national call has been made to better prepare our students for the world they will inherit. This call has been made not just to teachers and schools, but also to the institutions that teach, train and support them. Traditionally, the response to this call has been "educational reform". Reform efforts historically have addressed either technical issues of teaching practice such as curriculum, assessment and pedagogical approach or have addressed institutional structures through re-organization.   While important, these reform efforts present only part of the story. The fabric of the teacher's world is made up of a complex weave of factors; these threads are not just technical or structural, but also deeply personal and even spiritual. If teaching is not simply a job, but a vocational calling as asserted by Hansen (1995) and others (Farkas, Johnson & Foley, 2000), then tending to the internal personal aspects of the teacher's well-being is just as important as tending to the external or technical aspects of teaching.

       However, our educational practice and policy has largely ignored such inner dimensions in recent years, and the effects of this neglect are being felt dramatically in the lives of teachers today. As stated by Intrator and Scribner (2000),

> There is a growing body of evidence that the teaching profession is in peril. Teachers are leaving in droves. These teachers cite the difficult working conditions, the excessive demands on teacher's time, the cumulative tool of working for an institution that fails to honor the commitment of teachers and a society that refuses to respect and fairly compensate the profession. (p. v)

This sentiment is captured in the voice of one 20-year elementary school teaching veteran:

> *I am exhausted. And I think it is a tough profession now anyway because you are suspected; you're not trusted; you're never doing enough. . . I have never had a time during my teaching career where I just didn't want to come to school. I felt that I was not having a positive effect on these kids. And it was startling, and a bit scary.*

This quote not only illuminates the "peril' discussed by Intrator and Scribner, but also the personal nature of the forces being exerted on teaching professionals today. The Report of the National Commission on Teaching and America's Future, <u>What Matters</u>

<u>Most</u>, notes three specific findings as critical to creating better schools and improving student achievement:

(1) What teachers know and can do is the most important influence on what students learn.
(2) Recruiting, preparing, and retaining good teachers is the central strategy for improving our schools.
(3) School reform cannot succeed unless it focuses on creating the conditions in which teachers can teach, and teach well.

(National Commission on Teaching and America's Future, 1996)

In order to address the implications in these findings, attention to the conditions which support, nurture and honor teachers must be part of quality teacher development and education reform efforts. This must include the internal aspects of the teacher's life and practice as well as the more technical aspects of the job of teaching. This premise holds that our schools must not only be places of competent technical practice, but also places where the dedication, commitment and spirit of educators is supported, nourished and honored. It is these essential aspects of the fabric of teachers' lives that Courage to Teach has sought for over ten years to develop and strengthen.

Over the past decade Courage to Teach has pursued its mission in a thoughtful, dedicated and meaningful way. The Courage to Teach (CTT) Seasonal retreat program now boasts over 3000 alumni nationally. This foundation of participant experience and CTT practice offers a wealth of knowledge and insight into the role that teachers' identity, integrity and renewal play in the practice of good teaching. Data gathered from this base of participants provide compelling evidence of teacher formation as an effective and viable approach for developing and sustaining the best teachers for our nation's schools. As stated by Intrator and Scribner (2000),

It seems a simple truism: if the teacher is the most dramatic influence on what students learn, then the profession must help teachers reclaim their call to the vocation of teaching. The Courage to Teach program and approach to Teacher Formation offers the profession a compelling alternative to the gruel-thin models of professional development that presently dominate the profession" (p. iv)

The research to date not only supports this initial conclusion made by Intrator and Scribner (1998, 2000), but also offers a deeper and even more compelling vision of the contributions made by the Courage to Teach program to the lives of teachers, the lives of students and the field of education as a whole.

Michael I. Poutiatine, Ph.D
August, 2005

Executive Summary:

        In the past ten years the literature calling for broader and deeper approaches to teacher development and school reform has grown significantly. It is no coincidence that the Teacher Formation movement has grown significantly during this time as well. Teachers, administrators and school leaders of all kinds have turned to Courage to Teach in search of quality professional development that speaks not just to their heads, but also their hearts. The impact of such authentic engagement is being felt in districts, schools and classrooms. In order to understand these impacts, a number of research studies have been undertaken over the past eight years to bring to light aspects of teachers' professional practice that are supported by the Courage to Teach program.

        While the research on Teacher Formation, and specifically the Courage to Teach program is still in its initial phases, some specific themes and outcomes have emerged that present a picture of the value and efficacy of this approach. This research identifies these common themes and answers the question, *What can Courage to Teach do for teachers*?   An extensive review of research to date includes; (1) three primary studies of Courage to Teach and the process of Teacher Formation; (2) five secondary studies on principles, practices and conceptions of "inner-work" as teacher development; and, (3) six evaluative studies of Courage to Teach programs. In summarizing this research on Teacher Formation and Courage to Teach, five themes are found in nearly all of the work completed on Courage to Teach to date. These themes show that participation in Courage to Teach fosters:

   1) The Development of Professional Teaching Skills;

- Listening
- Construction of hospitable learning environments
- Use of "third thing" pedagogy
- Use of questions in the learning process
- The professional use of reflective practices

  2) The Development of Professional Teaching Dispositions and Attitudes;

- Improved skills and disposition towards constructive collegiality
- Increased relational trust capacity.
- Understanding of and disposition towards better caretaking and care-giving
- Improved relationships, both personal and professional
- Increased vocational and personal clarity of purpose

- Improved self-acceptance, confidence and courage in both personal and vocational aspects of life
- Improved leadership clarity and capacity

3) Professional and Personal Growth;

- Ability to identify their own individual gifts and abilities
- Ability to identify individual gifts and abilities of students
- Increases capacity for and disposition towards creating caring reciprocal relationships with students and colleagues
- Clarification and affirmation of personal beliefs about education
- Increased commitment towards and understanding of individual health and vitality as they relate to vocational life.

4) Personal and Professional Life Integration;

- Increased ability to integrate personal and professional aspects of life and work towards more authentic identity manifestation
- Increased understanding of the role that identity plays in vocational practice

5) Personal and Professional Renewal and Transformation;

- Increased understanding of and capacity for developing and integrating renewal experiences as part of on-going professional development.
- Experience of renewal as being both sustaining and transforming in vocational life.

These five themes do not represent all of the noted outcomes indicated by the current research, but rather the common threads that appear repeatedly in the exploration of Teacher Formation work. It is clear from the research that participation in Courage to Teach programs can affect teachers and their professional practice in profound and lasting ways. While not all participants report experiencing every outcome noted, the research indicated that many experience most of these as outcomes as a result of their participation. The research indicated that most participants believe their CTT experience positively affected their students and their schools, as well as their personal and professional lives.

Background Information and Selected Review of Literature

Courage to Teach is a program for the personal and professional renewal of teachers. The program is designed specifically for K-12 public school educators, counselors, specialists and administrators. The program is designed around a cohort

model with a group of educators coming together in a series of quarterly retreats that last two to three days. A seasonal retreat series typically spans 18 months to 2 years on a seasonal basis. Each Courage to Teach (CTT) cohort is made up of between 20 and 30 educators.

During retreats in large group, small group, and solitary settings, concepts of Teacher Formation including issues of identity, integrity and renewal. Through the use of personal stories, reflections on classroom practice, and insights from poets, storytellers, and various wisdom traditions, educators revisit the "heart of the teaching". Each retreat follows a seasonal theme, using nature's metaphors as a way of exploring vocational and life questions.

The Courage to Teach program and the principles and practices that guide Teacher Formation were developed by Parker J. Palmer, Ph.D. with assistance form the Fetzer Institute in Michigan from 1994-1996. The first "pilot" retreat series was very successful and led to the program expanding to other cities across the nation, again with the generous support of the Fetzer Institute. The continued success of CTT programs led to the establishment of a national Center for Teacher Formation in 1997, whose mission is to expand and develop Courage to Teach programs through sponsoring introductory retreats, training of new CTT facilitators and supporting the development of locally supported programs. Funding for Courage to Teach programs comes largely from grant making organizations in concert with support from school districts and partnerships with community organizations. Currently Courage to Teach boasts over 3000 alumni nationally from their programs. At this time Courage to programs are being offered in over 25 cities across the nation.

How does Courage to Teach Work?

Courage to Teach is grounded on the belief that honoring and nurturing the inner lives of teachers is an essential aspect of building and sustaining our schools. In his acclaimed work, *The Courage to Teach* (1998), Parker Palmer states, "good teaching cannot be reduced to technique; good teaching comes from the identity and integrity of the teacher" (p. 10). This simple and profound notion that the identity and integrity of the teacher are the wellspring of good teaching provides the foundation for the Courage to

Teach program. The idea that teacher identity is critical to good teaching has a long history in the field of teacher development, (Ayres, 1987, 1995, 2001; Bolin & Falk, 1987; Clark, 1992, 1995; Coombs, 1965; Coombs, Blume, Newman, & Wass, 1974; Grimmett & Mackinnon, 1992; Hargreaves & Fullan , 1992, 1996; Huberman,1993; Jesild, 1952, 1955; Joyce, 1975; Nais, 1989). This principle has provided a building block for educational practitioners and theorists to improve their conception of what good teaching is and how we can support good practice in our classrooms.

In a recent effort to conceptualize good teaching, Korgathagen (2004) lists six core qualities that can serve as a foundation for good professional practice. Those components are; "mission, identity, beliefs, competencies, behavior, and environment" (p. 88).   In this model, mission, identity and belief are found within the teacher themselves at the core, while competencies, behaviors and environment lie more in external manifestation. Korgathagen is careful to note that none of these qualities is more important or primal than any of the others; rather it is the development and alignment of all of them that is required. Teaching is a deeply personal vocation (Farkas, Johnson & Foley, 2000; Hansen, 1995, 2001) that requires more than just technical skill and know-how to do well. Approches to teacher development that underscore the capacity towards authentic, caring and competent engagement with students and colleagues have begun to populate the landscape of the professional development literature. Most of these newer approaches have a central component of what Korgathagen (2005) calls "core reflection".

Korgathagen's (2004, 2005) notion of core reflection is central to what Courage to Teach offers teachers and the heart of what is coming to be known as "courage work". Core reflection is the ability to recognize, clarify and develop beliefs, values and personal mission in a vocational context. It offers the teacher the opportunity to gain clarity about their calling and to find ways to manifest that clarity in their daily work with students and colleagues. Korgathagen's conception of core reflection aligns closely with the stated mission and focus of Courage to Teach which can be summarized as:

- Renewing the heart, mind and spirit of teachers through the exploration of the inner landscape of teachers' lives;

- Reconnecting teachers identity and integrity; identifying and honoring gifts and strengths and acknowledging limits;

- Creating a context for deep listening and connection that honors the diversity within the individual as well as the profession of teaching;

- Supporting educators in creating safe spaces and trusting reciprocal relationships in their schools with students, parents, and colleagues;

- Exploring the relationship between attending to inner dimensions of teachers and teaching and the renewal of public education.
        (Paraphrased from Intrator and Scribner 2000 and the Center for Teacher Formation website)

This mission also draws strength and validity from the stories told by teachers in their daily lives. As stated by one Courage to Teach participant;

> *This [CTT] is the kind of professional development I need right now. It is not my practice that is suffering right now, it is my being. If I cannot be a whole person for my kids, I cannot do my job. (Elementary School Teacher and Administrator, 23 years)*

Three evaluative studies of participants in Courage to Teach programs in Washington state (Poutiatine 2002, 2003a, 2003b) found that prior to participating in the CTT program participants listed four factors that impacted their professional practice. These were:

- Balance and integration of personal and professional life
- Creating authentic positive trusting relationships with students and colleagues
- Improving the quality and quantity of reflection in their professional practice
- Learning skills and creating space for renewal, both personally and professionally in their lives.

A substantial majority stated that their participation in CTT improved their practice in some or all of these areas. These areas of concern for teachers seems to align with the internal aspects of teaching practice that Korgathagen (2005) notes can be best addressed through a process of core reflection.

In much the same way Intrator (2004) presents the various aspects of teacher development as being encompassed by "the way of subject. . . the way of method. . . the way of understanding students. . . and the way of the heart" (pp. 2-3). As stated by Intrator (2004),

In short, my contention is that inspired, memorable teaching irretrievably depends on the condition of a teacher's heart. Our capacity to engage students, connect them to the subjects we teach, intervene in their lives, discern their needs, attend to their development, and cultivate constructive relationships with colleagues and parents depends on the condition of that "core place" of the teacher. (p. 7)

To develop these foundational qualities of good teaching requires an understanding that the heart of good teaching lies not just in strong pedagogic practice or solid content knowledge, but <u>the heart of good teaching also lies in the teacher's heart</u>. The principles and practices of core reflection offer a means by which teachers can access the heart of their own practices.

Research Review: What does Courage to Teach Actually do for Educators?

Since 1998 research on Teacher Formation, and Courage to Teach in particular, as been growing steadily. To date studies have been of three kinds: (1) Primary Research (mostly Doctoral dissertations); (2) Secondary Studies (research on conceptions related to Teacher Formation principles and/or practice); and, (3) evaluative studies of Courage to Teach Programs specifically. The primary and secondary research studies have been qualitative in nature and based on participant self-report. The stories of teachers' experiences with Courage to Teach and the transformational aspects of engagement with courage work are compelling, with common themes weaving throughout the research.

For this document three primary and five secondary academic studies of Courage to Teach specifically or of topics closely related to Teacher Formation were reviewed. In addition six evaluative studies of Courage to Teach programs were reviewed. Significant common themes are found throughout the primary, secondary and evaluative studies of Courage to Teach and Teacher Formation. The first is that while Courage to Teach does not proscribe specific outcomes for participants, research shows there are tangible common results experienced by the vast majority of the participants. These results can be broken five specific outcome areas:

- The Development of Professional Teaching Skills
- The Cultivation of Professional Teaching Dispositions and Attitudes
- Professional and Personal Growth
- Personal and Professional Life Integration
- Personal and Professional Renewal and Transformation

While the research does not support the conclusion that all participants will be impacted in all of these areas through participation in Courage to Teach programs, it does support the notion that most participants will be significantly impacted in one or more of these areas. The research on Courage to Teach principles, practices and outcomes to date is beginning to show how the program benefits educators in specific ways. The research supports the idea that these results, individually or in concert, have the potential to change the life and practice of teachers significantly.

How does Courage to Teach Impact Educators' Professional Teaching Skills?

The development of a specific set of professional teaching skills has been documented as an outcome of participation in Courage to Teach programs in all of the studies reviewed to date. These skills can be categorized into five specific areas of impact. These areas are: listening; the construction of learning environments; the use of "third-thing" pedagogy; the use of questions in the learning process; and, the use of reflective practices professionally.

Listening:

The skill of listening, particularly the transformational power of deep listening, was mentioned as a significant outcome in all of the primary and evaluative studies reviewed. As described by one CTT participant,

> *We don't listen a lot, our culture doesn't listen a lot, what we call listening is not listening. And so [at CTT] there's an active and deep listening, creating space in your head and heart for the words of another, so that practice of actively, deeply listening to another and how that is so related to honoring the soul; one of the most profound and fundamental ways we honor is listening. (HS Teacher, 18 years)*

The role and impact of listening in the context of teaching and learning has been studied extensively and recognized as a critical skill to good teaching (Kohl, 1967; Jackson, 1990; Lortie, 1975; Nais, 1985), as well as a component to developing quality collegial relationships in schools (Hargreaves, 1992; Nais 1989). The evaluative studies (Faulkner, 2003; Intrator & Scribner, 1998, 2000; Poutiatine, 2002, 2003a, 2003b) all reported that participants found their ability to listen constructively and deeply to students

was enhanced. Poutiatine (2005) also noted participants reporting a deeper understanding of the listening process in their practice.

Construction of Hospitable Learning Environments:

The ability to build safe and positive environments for student learning has long been a focus of educational practice (Lortie, 1975). In recent years research has indicated that aspects of learning environments beyond safety (physical, emotional, psychological) can impact learning dramatically (Caine & Caine, 1991; Jensen, 1998, 2000). These aspects involve the creation of learning environments that are not only safe, but are hospitable and invitational for student learning. In Poutiatine (2005), increased understanding and attention to the creation of hospitality in learning environments was noted as a central outcome of participation in CTT. As described by another CTT participant,

> *I am much more careful [after CTT] about the creation of my teaching spaces now. I mean, I always could create safe spaces, but they were not always welcoming. (High School Teacher, 8 years)*

Use of "Third-Thing" Pedagogy:

The third-thing pedagogy represents a specific approach to teaching that invites learners into a process of cognitive and emotive reflection that seeks to integrate personal understanding and content knowledge. This approach often requires the student to access deeper feeling and understandings about themselves through the use of specific evocative content such as poetry or literature. Both the Poutiatine (2005) and Poutiatine (2003b) studies found participant reporting an increased use of this pedagogic approach in their classrooms, particularly in situations calling for student reflection on learning. And further, that participants felt the use of third thing pedagogy created better, more effective learning for their students. Poutiatine (2005) also found that educational administrators applied such processes with administrative teams in their school buildings and within their districts. These administrators reported an improved level of satisfaction and perceived efficacy in their administrative practice.

Use of Questions in the Learning:

The strategic use of questions as a learning tool can be a powerful practice for rich student learning in classrooms (Dantonio & Beisenherz, 2000). The improved use of questioning practices, particularly the use of open, honest questions (Livsey & Palmer, 1999, pp. 44-45) was a common outcome of participation in CTT programs. The Poutiatine (2005) study found that many participants reconsidered their classroom use of questions. As stated by one CTT facilitator,

> *I'm much more inclined to ask questions and to try to encourage either a student or a son who is struggling in one way or another to develop a sense of their own capacity to deal with that, whatever the issue is. . . I think I'm much more inclined to ask open, honest questions in general. So that's become kind of just more part of how I live my life. (Elementary School Teacher and CTT Facilitator)*

In addition the McMahon (2003) study reported the use of open and honest questions as a significant tool for teachers' personal and professional reflection..

The Professional Use of Reflective Practices:

Since the publication of Schon's work on reflective practice (1983, 1987) the importance of reflection in the profession of teaching has received much attention (Brookfield, 1995; Danielewicz, 2001; Darling-Hammond, 1997; Darling-Hammond & Sykes, 1999; Jay, 2003). These authors make the point that structured refection on professional practice can improve classroom teaching impact and efficacy. Virtually all primary and evaluative researchers commented that CTT participants reported an increase in the quality and quantity of their professional reflection on their practice as a direct result of their participation in CTT. As one participant stated, *"I am just better now [after CTT] at taking the time to reflect on what I am doing for my students and why" (Middle School Teacher, 18 years)*. The Simone (2004) study also found that structured reflection that utilized metaphoric language and other creative methods for participants to access the core identity issues created a positive context for this exploration and was often very effective for these participants. This finding was duplicated to some degree in Poutiatine (2005) as shown by this study participant quote,

When I have a better sense of who I am and what I am meant to do, I then can be more authentic, at-home, in my life and work. This requires reflection and it requires courage – to know who you are and to be who you are. (Middle School Teacher 23 years)

All of the studies reviewed mention the development of some or all of these skills as outcomes of engagement with Courage to Teach. While participants do not experience growth in all of these areas, most experience significant growth in one or more.

How does Courage to Teach Develop Professional Teaching Dispositions and Attitudes?

The National Board of Professional Teaching Standards (NBPTS) has championed the language of "professional teaching dispositions" in recent years (National Board of Professional Teaching Standards, 2003). The NBPTS cites specific attitudes and dispositions as being critical to good teaching. Among these the NBPTS cites the skills, capacities, and dispositions for developing strong relationships with students and colleagues as being essential to good teaching and the development of strong professional learning communities (National Board of Professional Teaching Standards Policy Statement, 2003, Five Core Propositions, section 5).

The cultivation of teaching dispositions and attitudes is discussed in most of the Courage to Teach studies reviewed. Though not all studies use the same language to describe these dispositions, the underlying conceptions have much in common. These attitudes and dispositions can be summarized in six specific areas: Collegiality; Trust Capacity; Caretaking and Care giving; Vocational and Personal Clarity of Purpose; Self Acceptance; and, Leadership Clarity and Capacity.

Collegiality*:*

In the research literature on the subject of collegiality in schools there are two distinct findings that stand out. The first is that collegiality is essential to good professional practice in schools (Barth 2001; Collinson, 1994; Darling-Hammond, 1994, 1997; Darling-Hammond & Sykes, 1999; Grimmett & Neufeld, 1994; Hargreaves & Fullan, 1992; Lieberman, 1994; Nais, 1989; Sergiovanni, 1994, 2000; Senge et al. 2000). The second is that environments that foster strong collegial relationships are rare in

schools (Hargreaves, 1994; Hargeaves & Fullan, 1992; Kohn, 1999; Senge et al., 2000; Sizer 1992).

A thread found throughout the research reviewed for this document shows that participation in Courage to Teach can have a dramatic impact on participants' perceived willingness and ability to enter into and maintain quality collegial relationships in their workplaces. As reported in the Poutiatine evaluations (2002, 2003a, 2003b) an increase in the capacity for collegial appreciation and collaboration was a common outcome experiences by many CTT participants. As reported by one CTT participant,

> It's [participation in CTT] changed how I relate to my colleagues, too, because I've learned in very real ways that we all have birthright gifts and everybody's gift has a shadow. But in order to get rid of the shadow you lose the gift. So I've really   become better at finding ways to relate to them [colleagues]. It really makes work more fun for me. (High School Teacher 24 years)

An increased sense of the value of good collegial relationships was also expressed as an outcome of participation in CTT in both the Simone (2004) and McMahon (2003) studies.

Trust Capacity:

Trust is essential in building caring reciprocal relationships with both students and colleagues in schools (Byrk & Schneider, 2002; Tschammen-Moran, 2004). In a large longitudinal study Byrk and Schneider (2002) found that schools with higher relational trust capacity in their faculty and staff tended to have students with higher academic achievement levels. They also found that improvement in student academic achievement had a positive correlation to improved relational trust levels in schools. The Poutiatine (2003b) study looked specifically at CTT participants' perceptions of their own relational trust capacity and the impact participation in CTT may have had on that capacity. An astounding 100% of the participants in that study reported an increase in their understanding of and capacity for relational trust in their workplaces. These participants reported a perceived increase in their own capacity to trust in their colleagues, their supervisors, their students and most of all themselves because of their participation in Courage to Teach. As summarized by one CTT participant,

Because of the competition and overwhelming work load that is built into our work [educational leadership] we don't adhere or pay attention to trust issues anymore. Courage to Teach helps to go back to "the basics" and finds ways to re-create the trust in our schools.. (High School Administrator, 31 years)

Caretaking and Care-Giving

The attitude and disposition of understanding the relationship between taking care of the self and the capacity to give care to others was discussed in all of the evaluative studies reviewed as well as two of the primary studies (Poutiatine 2005; Simone, 2004). Participants in CTT programs reported gaining a greater understanding of their ability to care for their students through caring for themselves, as well as an increased capacity for doing so. As stated by one CTT participant.

> *I think one of my personal outcomes is being reminded very clearly about needing to take care of myself. They did it so well here in these four ` retreats we had, but I'm actually being very intentional about looking for ways to do that. (Elementary School Teacher, 15 years)*

Poutiatine's (2005) study also found that increasing the understanding of the relationship between self-caretaking and caring for students increased the quality and quantity of time they devoted to taking care of them selves and in turn produced a perceived increase in their capacity and ability to care for their students.

Tracey Denlinger 8/5/08 9:32 AM
Deleted: (This sentence needs reworking)

Vocational and Personal Clarity of Purpose

The ability to understand and manifest a personal sense of purpose in the vocation of teaching has been recognized as a critical component for student learning for some time (Hamachek, 1999: Hansen, 2001; Hargreaves & Fullen, 1992; Jersild, 1952, 1955). Jersild (1952) notes,

> *Consciously we teach what we know; unconsciously we teach who we are.* The "who we are" facet of our teaching personality contribute significantly to the positive or negative tone of a classroom and certainly, to the students' receptivity to learning. (pp. 209-210; emphasis in original)

All of the evaluative and primary studies note the power of Courage to Teach to support the process of gaining vocational clarity and reconnecting participants to their own core values concerning teaching. This finding was underscored by the Poutiatine (2005) study

in which vocational clarity was noted as a significant outcome of participation in CTT programs. As cited by one CTT participant,

> *I just have a much clearer idea now of who I am and what's important to me, and [when it comes to] those extraneous things that are very important and create a lot of pressure on me as a teacher, I just have to ask myself, what's really important here? I believe that that's an intention of the[CTT] program, is just to clarify who we are. (Middle School Teacher 12 years)*

Participants often reported that this clarity of purpose led to a greater degree of confidence in their professional practice (Poutiatine, 2002, 2003a, 2003b).

Self Acceptance, Confidence and Courage

In two related secondary studies, Pressley (1992) and Coward (2003) both cited the capacity for self acceptance as an important capacity for teachers and a factor that teachers believe contributes significantly to student learning. An improved degree of professional and personal self acceptance was noted as an outcome of participation in CTT programs by all of the primary and evaluative studies reviewed for this document. As stated by one participant from the Poutiatine study (2005),

> *It's been part of the journey of trying to be true to the self and get through the struggles that causes because it's not easy. It's really hard. I mean, it takes a lot of courage to live by what you believe in. (School Counselor and CTT Facilitator 25 year)*

In two of Poutiatine's evaluative studies (2003a, 2003b), the development of self acceptance was closely linked in most participant's reports to an increase in professional self confidence and the ability to courageously act on personal beliefs in the workplace. The Poutiatine (2005) study cites this as the development of professional and personal integrity.

Leadership Clarity and Capacity

The capacity for taking on leadership roles in schools appears copiously in the literature on school reform (Barth 1990, 2001; Darling-Hammond & Sykes, 1999; Dufour 1991; Hargreaves, 1994; Senge et al. 2000; Sergiovanni, 1994; Sizer, 1992a, 1992b). The consensus in the literature on school development and reform seems to be moving

towards the idea that the greater the degree of leadership assumed by the teachers, the more effective the school will be as an organization. The Intrator and Scribner studies (1998, 2000) note that participants in Courage to Teach programs felt their capacity and ability to take leadership roles was enhanced. As stated by one CTT participant,

> *CTT gave me a powerful model for how to promote teacher growth by empowering individuals and supporting a very personal honoring of what people already know and the power of what's in their hearts. . . With my increased interest, confidence, and skills in the interpersonal area, I took a number of big steps into new terrain professionally last year. I became a department chair and math curriculum specialist for my building . . . (High School Teacher, 14 years)*

Poutiatine (2003a, 2003b, 2005) found that as a result of participating in CTT educators tended to carefully evaluate their leadership roles in schools and increase or decrease those roles as a result of careful and personal discernment. While some participants clearly increased their leadership roles as found in Intrator and Scribner (2000), Poutiatine found that some altered their leadership roles in order to be more effective in the leadership positions that mattered most to them.

Each of these dispositions and attitudes (collegiality, trust, caretaking, self acceptance, vocational clarity, and leadership) were cited repeatedly throughout the literature on Courage to Teach Research. It is clear that participants experienced significant growth in these areas as a result of participation in Courage to Teach programs.

Does Courage to Teach Contribute to Teacher's Professional and Personal Growth?

The area of personal and professional growth was perhaps the most common area of outcome for the studies reviewed for this summary. All of the studies noted participants self-report of significant growth professionally and personally as a result of participation in Courage to Teach programs. As summarized by one CTT participant,

> *It's [formational process] about helping you understand yourself, because if you don't have that understanding of the deeper parts of yourself it's hard to be a good teacher. . . I'd say it's about personal growth" (Middle School Educator 18 years).*

While the descriptions of these experiences differ some between studies, the Intrator and Scribner study (2000) summarized statements made in several studies. These findings were:

Ability to identify their own individual gifts and abilities coupled with the capacity use those gifts in enhance student learning.

- Ability to Identify Individual Gifts and Abilities of Students coupled with the ability to help students use those gifts in their learning

- Caring Reciprocal Relationships with Students and Colleagues, increasing capacity for and understanding of how to create good relationships with students

- Clarification and Affirmation of Personal Beliefs about Education coupled with an increased ability to manifest those beliefs in the classroom. This included reports of teachers of gaining insight into themselves that increased their feeling of personal investment and effectiveness in their classrooms.

- Individual Health and Vitality, increasing understanding of and capacity for attending to their own health and vitality and how that impacts students in the classroom.

Several studies also noted a deeper understanding of the role that "inner-work" plays in teachers' professional lives and development.

Does Courage to Teach Foster Personal and Professional Life Integration in Teachers?

Personal and professional life integration was specifically mentioned in two of the primary academic studies (Poutiatine, 2005; Simone, 2004). Participants in these studies often mentioned the ability to bring more of themselves into their workplaces. Participants cited this as having a profound positive impact on the quality of their teaching as well as the perceived quality of their personal lives. These studies reported an increase in the ability to prioritize time, and a greater ability to bring authenticity to all the various roles participants engaged in, both personally and professionally. This included an increased capacity for self-forgiveness.

How does Courage to Teach Foster Personal and Professional Renewal and Transformation in Educators?

The need for mechanisms that support personal and professional renewal in education has been recognized in much of the literature on education professional

development (Danielewicz, 2001; Darling-Hammond, 1004; Lipka & Brinthaupt, 1999, Gardner, 1963; Grimmet & Neufeld, 1994, Goodlad, 1994; Senge et al., 2000). Recognition of the role of personal and professional renewal was pervasive across the research literature on Courage to Teach and on Teacher Formation. Participants in all of the primary and evaluative studies noted that personal and professional renewal was perhaps the most significant outcome of participating in Courage to Teach programs. While every research study reviewed defined renewal differently, all underscored it as a critical outcome for participants.

Poutiatine (2005) looked analytically at the renewal experience of Courage to Teach participants and identified four types of renewal experienced by participants. These included:

- <u>Renewal as retreat</u> – The experience of getting away with structured time for quiet reflection

- <u>Renewal as identity engagement</u> – The experience of re-connecting with core beliefs, values and mission

- <u>Renewal as integrity commitment</u> – The experience of re-connection with core beliefs, values and mission coupled with a sense of commitment to manifesting those in their personal and vocational lives

- <u>Renewal as transformation</u> – The experience of a new, deeper or broader understanding of themselves and their relationship to the world that often constituted a fundamental reordering of world views, values, beliefs or mission orientation.

 This study found that participation in Courage to Teach often led to deep levels of personal and professional renewal for participants. This finding was supported to a substantial degree by the McMahon (2003) study. McMahon (2003) found that participation in Courage to Teach was described as a "personally and professionally renewing experience" by all the study's participants.

The Intrator & Scribner Longitudinal study (2000) also noted the potential expressed by participants for organizational renewal as a possible outcome of Courage to Teach. Intrator and Scribner state,

> 100% of the study participants believed that teacher formation could lead to enduring and vital? change in American education. . . Their endorsement of the CTT program's capacity to invite thoughtful, caring improvements in education might be, in the final analysis, the most compelling finding in this evaluation. (p. 22).

This endorsement of the belief that the power of the CTT program can bring lasting change, not only to individuals, but also to schools and even districts, was found in most of the studies reviewed for this document (McMahon, 2003; Poutiatine, 2005; Simone, 2004).

It is clear from the research that Courage to Teach provides a vital and currently under-emphasized dimension of professional development for many teachers. The data suggests that many teachers, particularly those in mid-career, can benefit significantly from the type of holistic professional and personal development offered by the Courage to Teach. If we are to present our educational system, our schools and especially our students with healthy, skilled, competent and vibrant teachers, we must attend to all aspects of their professional development. Courage to Teach honors, nurtures and sustains the threads that form the intricate tapestry of comprehensive professional development.

APPENDIX A

Annotated Summary of Research on Courage to Teach and Teacher Formation

The following is a brief summary of some of selected research that has been done on the Courage to Teach Program and on the process of teacher formation. The research summarized here is by no means comprehensive, but rather chosen because of its relevance to the Courage to Teach program. The research discussed here is of three types: (1) Secondary academic studies, generally doctoral dissertations; (2) Primary academic studies; and (3) evaluative studies of the Courage to Teach program specifically.

Secondary Academic Studies:

While relatively few studies have been published on teacher formation specifically, there have been many studies on topics, issues and specific conceptions related to the process of Teacher Formation. The area that seems to have garnered the most attention of these related fields of study is that of teacher renewal.

Carotta, C. C. (1999). *Sustaining a vocation: Adaptive challenges and proposed practices.* **Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Spalding University, Louisville, KY.**

Whitlock, N. A. (2003). *A conceptual framework for teacher renewal.* **Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Spalding University, Louisville, KY.**

In two related qualitative studies of teacher renewal that dealt with the vocational aspects of teaching, Whitlock (2003) and Carotta (1999) came to similar conclusions about the nature of renewal in teacher development. As stated by Whitlock (2003), "teacher renewal must be understood as a process, allowing educators to develop personally and professional through high levels of critical reflection" (p. 77). Whitlock also makes the point that personal and professional renewal as teacher development is not seen as a substitute for increased instructional expertise, but as an essential complement to it. Whitlock notes that teacher renewal must be collaborative in design and collegial in nature in order to be truly effective. Carotta (1999) suggests that individuals who sustain

themselves over time may do so partly because of their personal dispositions of hopefulness and positive attitude, partly because of their intellectual skills for critical and reflective thinking, and partly because of their moral and sociological ethics for supporting and seeking support from others. Further, Carotta states that "'working through their stories' is an opportunity for educators to participate in transformative moments, altering their understandings and transcending their current actions" (p. 130). In her recommendations for further study Carotta calls for an "investigation of teacher renewal programs, their curricula, and their outcomes" (p. 133).

_____

Mysliwiec, M. A. (1997). *Creating a handbook for principals seeking ideas for teacher renewal.* **Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Columbia University, New York.**

Mysliwiec (1997), in a qualitative study of school principals, concludes that materials that provide ideas for how to promote professional growth and renewal in teachers are needed. In her study, Myliswiec used a deep ethnographic case study approach to look at the experiences of principals who were working to support the teachers in their schools.   She found that principals often note teachers in need of renewal, but lack the "explicit rounded rational to guide their practice" (p. 177). Myliswiec noted that her study participants often wished for a more comprehensive approach to teacher development that included the principles and practices of teacher renewal. In her recommendations for further research, Myliswiec calls for study of new and better ways to support teacher renewal and to "model teacher-relevant staff development" (p. 179).

_____

Pressley, C. A. (1992). *The impact of teacher renewal seminars on classroom practice: A case study of selected participants of the North Carolina Center for the Advancement of Teaching.* **Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of North Carolina at Greensboro, Greensboro, NC.**

Coward, R. H. (2003). *Teacher renewal and commitment to education: A qualitative analysis of teachers' experiences at the North Carolina Center for the Advancement of Teaching (NCCAT).* **Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Western Carolina University, Cullowhee, NC.**

In a mixed methodology study, Pressley (1992) found that teachers changed their classroom practices significantly after participating in a retreat-based professional renewal program for teachers at the North Carolina Center for the Advancement of Teaching (NCCAT). These changes were reflected in greater feelings of self-worth, improved outlooks on their profession, and specific changes in pedagogy and curriculum that the participants felt improved student learning (1992, pp. 158-170). In a related multidimensional qualitative study of the North Carolina Center for the Advancement of Teaching (NCCAT), Coward (2003) notes that "teacher development centers are a rarity within the world of professional development" (p. 73). Coward outlines only five centers (NCCAT, Center for Teacher Formation, Florida Center for Teachers, Center for the Advancement and Renewal of Educators, and Minnesota Institute for the Advancement of Teaching) for teacher renewal nationwide who do renewal programming for teachers on a regular basis. Coward states that her findings indicate that "honoring the teacher's voice and years of experience within the professional development experience encourages teachers to feel respected" (p. 248). Coward also notes importance of "honoring [the] adult learner's need for time for deep learning, as deep learning often leads to deep introspection into the teacher's practice" (p. 247). In her study Coward presents a model of renewal that was generated by her study called the Renewal Model (2003, p. 233). Coward recommends that this model be further explored in the context of teacher renewal programming to determine its value as a model of teacher renewal.

Primary Academic Studies:

To date there have been three published primary academic studies on the Courage to Teach program or on the subject of teacher formation as practiced or supported by The Center for Teacher Formation. All of these studies are qualitative in nature and utilized participant interviews as their primary source of data.

McMahon, L. G. (2003). *Rekindling the spirit to teach: A qualitative study of the* *personal and professional renewal of teachers.* **Unpublished doctoral** **dissertation, Gonzaga University, Spokane, WA.**

In the first of these studies, McMahon (2003) completed a heuristic phenomenology of eleven teachers identified as experienced educators who purposefully

seek ways to retain their commitment and passion in their work. All eleven had participated in Courage to Teach retreat series for professional development and renewal. McMahon presents seven specific conclusions in her study:

1) depletion and burnout are serious realities for teachers
2) teachers must be attuned to sources and risks of burnout and initiate strategies to ward it off
3) the intrinsic rewards of teaching help to counter the difficulties of teaching
4) teacher formation work provides valuable tools for staying renewed
5) contemplating identity and integrity assists teachers in their renewal process
6) a sense of calling provides a sense of fulfillment and purpose for teachers
7) teachers who utilize a variety of personal and professional renewal activities to balance the demands of teaching preserve commitment and fulfillment in teaching. (p. 196)

McMahon suggests that the answer to helping develop and sustain teachers' passion and commitment for teaching involves both decreasing the elements that deplete teachers' energies and increase the opportunities for renewal among teachers. The teachers in her study listed many common sources of depletion for teachers. These included systemic requirements, the isolation of teachers, excessive workloads, reduced autonomy in the classroom, a perceived lack of respect for the profession, and inadequate resources (2003, pp. 201-205). All of these factors are mentioned in Intrator's (2002) teacher narrative framework concerning the pressures of the teaching profession.

McMahon (2003) notes in her study that all of the participants had "a remarkable level of self-knowledge" (p. 197); several participants attributed their self-knowledge level to their work with teacher formation. This knowledge included a detailed understanding of the forces that depleted their energies as teachers and those that sustained their energies as teachers. McMahon points out that her participants' degree of self-knowledge often revolved around their ability to understand their own identities as teachers and the role their personal integrity played in their teaching. Several of McMahon's study participants stated that their participation in the Courage to Teach program had significantly helped them to develop these understandings. McMahon notes that all eleven participants worked consciously at staying renewed in their personal and professional lives (p. 213). McMahon further notes that teachers in her study had two general sets of practices that helped them stay renewed in their jobs. These were characterized as solitary practices of reflection and the cultivation of "supportive caring

relationships at school" (pp. 213-214). McMahon (2003) recommends that teachers utilize practices that both allow time for individual reflection and build supportive community in order to keep renewed in their professional practice. McMahon proposes that the degree of effectiveness of this two-pronged approach to teacher renewal is often contingent upon support from the schools and organizations in which the teachers work. McMahon insists, "The need for strong, transformational leadership [in schools] is essential in creating an environment that fosters renewal" (p. 217). McMahon recommends that further study in the field of teacher renewal practices and programs is necessary to gain a better understanding of how to support and develop good teachers.

_____

Simone, G. (2004*). Professional development as a process of renewal: Case studies of the Courage to Teach program.* Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Colorado at Boulder, Boulder, CO.

Simone (2004), in her multiple case study of a Courage to Teach teacher renewal and development program, found that inner work, that is exploration of the self in relation to vocation, was an essential part of professional development for her study's participants. Most of her participants understood the value of inner work to their professional development and working life, but felt this aspect was rarely part of formal professional development programs in their schools. Regarding this inner work, Simone found that frequently the initial stages of this self-exploration often resulted in a "feeling of disengagement or disorientation" (2004, p. 433). Simone observes that there is "a natural progression of uncertainty before clarity in the learning process, even for adults" (p. 434). This conclusion suggests two things: first, that the process of inner work (formation) follows a progression; and second, that a level of uncertainty or disorientation is part of this progression. Simone found that this progression followed a predictable sequence that involved the participant's willingness to reflect upon and reassess their identity in relation to core issues of belief (p. 395). This reassessment can lead to a newer and deeper sense of identity and a deeper manifestation of that identity in the vocational integrity of the individual participant.

Simone (2004) also found that structured reflection that utilized metaphoric language and other creative methods for participants to access the core identity issues

created a positive context for this exploration and was often very effective for these participants (2004, p. 434). Simone noted that in her participant group there were distinct differences between the ways in which men and women approached professional development in general and that these differences manifest in the Courage to Teach process. The primary difference cited by Simone was that the women in her study tended to be more willing to suspend expectation of outcome when engaging in formational kinds of professional development (pp. 434-435). Simone also notes that the participants in her study range broadly in their experience and that all professional development must take into account the career cycles of teachers in the format and conception of the development program. This observation suggests that teachers may take different things from formational kinds of professional development programs, depending upon where they are in their own career cycles.

Simone concludes her study by pointing out that the inner work that makes up much of teacher formation is essential to help teachers "negotiate the complex personal and structural landscapes of schools" (2004, p. 437), and that the structural landscapes of schools today offer up many more obstacles than supports for this kind of professional development. Simone indicates that the participants in her study all found teacher formation work an "important step in [building] teachers' capacities to negotiate the stresses endemic to the profession, and [help them] stay with their teaching when larger social and political forces threaten to push them out" (p. 437).

_____

Poutiatine, M. I. (2005*). *The role of identity and integrity in teacher development: Towards a grounded theory of Teacher Formation.*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Gonzaga University, Spokane, WA.

In a qualitative study of 15 teacher formation facilitators (all working with the Courage to Teach Program) and 16 Courage to Teach Seasonal Retreat Program participants, Poutiatine (2005) offers a detailed examination of the theory and practice of teacher formation. In the outcome section of the study, Poutiatine describes the perceived impacts of participation in a Courage to Teach program as presented by both facilitators of formational work with teachers and by the participants in the program. These outcomes include; (1) the development of specific inter- and intrapersonal skills

sets; (2) the development and cultivation of particular teaching dispositions and attitudes; (3) personal and professional growth; (4) personal and professional integration; and (5) personal and professional renewal.

Poutiatine (2005) describes the inter-and intrapersonal skill sets developed through participation in Courage to Teach programs as including: (1) improved listening skills; (2) increased attention to and skill in creating hospitable and invitational learning environments; (3) the use of questions to facilitate learning; (4) skills of reflective practice, and (5) the use of "third thing" (Palmer, 1998) pedagogy. All of these outcomes were either stated as experienced outcomes of participation in a Courage to Teach program or presented as observed outcomes by Courage to Teach facilitators (Poutiatine, 2005, pp. 240-303).

In terms of the development and cultivation of particular teaching dispositions and attitudes, Poutiatine (2005) notes these as: (1) an improved capacity for collegial relationships in the workplace (both in terms of skills in building these relationships and motivation towards building these relationships); (2) improved trust capacity in both the self and in colleagues; (3) improved understanding of and capacity for caretaking and care-giving in their professional lives; (4) improved vocational and personal clarity; and (5) improved self-acceptance, self-confidence, and courage in the vocational lives.

Of particular importance in the Poutiatine (2005) study is the observation that not all participants in the Courage to Teach program experience all of these outcomes, rather participants tend experience outcomes that have some resonance with their current relationship to their vocation and profession. Because the Courage to Teach program does not have a particular mission or outcome focus that is more specific than honoring and supporting the heart and spirit of teachers, the outcomes listed above depend much upon the participants themselves. Poutiatine (2005) found that the attitude of the participant and the level at which they chose to engage with the process of Teacher Formation greatly affected the outcomes perceived by program participants. In other words, the more participants put in to their participation in their CTT experience, in terms of being open to possibility for growth, the broader and deeper the reported impact of the program was on their personal and professional lives.

In terms of personal and professional renewal the Poutiatine (2005) study found that the experience of renewal as an outcome of participation with the Courage to Teach program was manifested differently in participants. At least four different types of personal and professional renewal were presented in this study as being either experienced by the participants or observed by the Courage to Teach facilitators. These types ranged from the renewal of just getting away in retreat to the profound renewal of transformational learning. While not all participants in the study experienced renewal as an outcome of their participation in a Courage to Teach program, a significant number of participants felt a renewed energy and commitment towards their jobs as educators. Some participants in the study described profound renewal that, as one participant noted, "saved my career".

Evaluative Studies of Courage to Teach Programs:

To date there have been six formal evaluative studies of programs sponsored by the Center for Teacher Formation. Three of these studies were structured as post participation surveys or interviews, the other three have been designed on a pre- and post-participation survey model. The first two of these studies were conducted with the New England Courage to Teach Program one of which was longitudinal in nature.

Intrator, S., & Scribner, M. (1998). *An evaluation of the Courage to Teach program.* **Bainbridge Island, WA: Center for Teacher Formation.**

Intrator, S., & Scribner, M. (2000). *A Longitudinal Program Evaluation of the Courage to Teach program.* **Bainbridge Island, WA: Center for Teacher Formation.**

In these two evaluative studies of Courage to Teach Intrator and Scribner (1998) outlined ten specific outcome themes identified by their study participants:

1)   Teachers felt the Courage to Teach program revitalized their teaching and had the potential to revitalize the practice of education in their work settings.
2)   Through their experiences with the program, teachers felt re-connected with their core beliefs about teaching.
3)   The Courage to Teach program served to help keep good teachers in the profession.

4)   Being nurtured through the program could and would support positive educational reform in their schools.

5)   The Courage to Teach program serves to renew teachers' faith in the value of teaching well.

6)   The program served to provide teachers with a better sense of their own sources of strength and vitality.

7)   The program provided the teachers with a better sense of, and access to, courage in their work.

8)   The Courage to Teach program helped teachers develop strategies for dealing with the uncertainties of the profession.

9)   The program helped teachers to see the value in and foster collegial relationships in their work settings.

10)   The Courage to Teach program encouraged teachers to take leadership roles in their work settings. (pp. 18-29)

In a follow-up longitudinal study, Intrator and Scribner (2000) reported the following changes in classroom practice as reported by twenty teachers who had completed a two-year Courage to Teach retreat program:

1) The Courage to Teach program helped teachers develop a renewed focus on developing caring reciprocal relationships with students.

2)   The program helped teachers become more attuned to the needs of their students and to create spaces and experiences that spoke to those needs. Teachers also felt participation in the program helped them to better be able to build community in their classrooms.

3) The program helped teachers to attend to "what they believe is important in the classroom, rather than falling prey to the increasing pressure regarding tests and standards.

4) The program provided teachers with an improved focus and ability to identify the individual gifts of the students in their care.

5) Teachers felt that participation in the Courage to Teach program served to affirm their own personal beliefs about education.

6) Teachers felt the program supported their individual health and vitality in the classroom. (pp. 13-16)

The Intrator and Scribner studies (1998, 2000) the researchers found their study participants to have been profoundly impacted by their experiences with Courage to Teach. The program participants interviewed for these studies noted the experience of renewal and rejuvenation in their work as educators to be "amazing". And while the participants for this study were purposefully selected, the overwhelming positive acclaim for the Courage to Teach program cannot be disregarded.

The remaining four evaluative studies adopted the same pre- and post-participation survey model. Each study used similar instruments consisting of both quantitative and qualitative items with pre and post participations versions of the instrument being utilized. All of the evaluative studies completed to date include a demographic analysis of participants as well. All of these evaluative studies focused on Courage to Teach Seasonal Retreat programs. These studies are:

Faulkner, A. (2003). *Evaluation of Courage to Teach Program - Texas.* Bainbridge Island, WA: Center for Teacher Formation.

Poutiatine, M. (2002). *Data analysis of Courage to Teach Teachers Surveys: Fall 2001.* Bainbridge Island, WA: Center for Teacher Formation.

Poutiatine, M. (2003a). *Data analysis of teachers pre-participation surveys: Fall 2002.* Bainbridge Island, WA: Center for Teacher Formation.

Poutiatine, M. (2003b). *Data analysis of Courage to Teach Teachers' Post Participation Survey: 2001-2003.* Bainbridge Island, WA: Center for Teacher Formation.

These studies showed remarkable similarity of results across the different participant groups. In a survey-based study of forty-five participants who had enrolled in but not yet attended an eighteen-month Courage to Teach program in Washington State (Poutiatine, 2002), three specific areas of development were identified as primary attractors to CTT Seasonal Retreat programs for teachers:

1) Teachers' perceived need to find a better balance between their professional and personal lives.

2) Teachers' perceived need to improve the quality and quantity of their time spent in reflection upon their professional practice.

3) Teachers' perceived need to improve the quantity and quality of their collegial relationships in their work settings. (pp. 3-5)

In a duplicate study of fifty-one participants who had registered in, but not started, an eighteen-month Courage to Teach retreat program in Washington State (Poutiatine, 2003a), the same three themes were reported as being the dominant attractors to the program (2003a, pp. 5-7). Similar themes were reported in a study of Community

College Instructors who participated in a professional development program similar to the Courage to Teach Teacher Formation Program (Faulkner, 2003).

In a post-participation study (Poutiatine, 2003b) of forty-one teachers who had just finished an eighteen-month Courage to Teach program in Washington State, all participants reported an increased sense of personal and professional satisfaction as compared to the date they started the Courage to Teach program. In addition, all participants in the study (Poutiatine, 2002) reported an increase in the time they allowed for renewal and reflection in their professional lives, as compared to the date they started the Courage to Teach program (pp. 3-4).   Participants generally reported improved collegial relationships in their schools after participation in a Courage to Teach program, and more broadly that they had increased their efforts to develop and maintain those relationships in their schools. The changes in the professional development and practice as seen in these studies represent a different model of teacher development and educational reform — one that is specifically reflected in the movement model of social change and is outlined by Palmer (1998).

Regarding perceived balance between their personal and professional lives(generally framed in terms of time spent on work as compared to time spent at home with family; Poutiatine 2002, 2003a), participants generally stated the positive outcome of feeling more able to balance these two competing aspects of their lives as a result of their participation in a Courage to teach program (Poutiatine 2003b). However, an interesting footnote to this finding is that many of the participants changed their language when discussing this initial attractor to the program after their participation in the program. While most participants who noted wanting to find a better balance between their personal and professional lives as an attractor to the Courage to Teach program, after participation they tended to discuss this as more an issue of integration, rather than balance. The foundation of this shift after participation in a Courage to Teach program seems to be in conceiving their personal and professional lives as two aspects of the same life that require integration; rather than the previous conception of having two distinct and separate lives, one labeled "personal" and the other "professional".

One other interesting finding in Poutiatine (2003b) is that some participants in Courage to Teach programs cited a reduction in their perceived leadership roles in their

schools and districts as an outcome of their participation in a Courage to Teach program. This is somewhat contradictory to the finding in Intrator and Scribner (1998), which found that the Courage to Teach program encouraged teachers to take leadership roles in their work settings (pp. 18-29). In the Poutiatine (2003b) study the finding was that participants in Courage to Teach programs tended to go through a critical evaluation of their leadership roles in their schools, which often caused a re-prioritization of how they used their time in leadership roles. This led some program participants to increase their leadership roles in their schools, while it led other to decrease the scope of their formal or perceived leadership efforts. In the Poutiatine (2003b) study many participants reported decreasing the number of leadership roles they played in their schools in favor of putting better and more concerted effort towards just one or two of those roles which they felt most strongly about.

The Poutiatine (2002, 2003a, 2003b) and Faulkner (2003) studies also showed interesting similarity in the demographic data gathered. While the range of participant demographics in terms of: age, gender, years in education, type of work environment, and ethnic or racial background were substantial, there was a definite trend towards a profile of Courage to Teach participants. A clear profile of a Courage to Teach participant in the Poutiatine studies emerged as female, Caucasian, 46-50 years in age, with 18-21 years of experiences in education. This profile came with a majority of the participants coming from urban or suburban schools, most with high levels of student poverty (as measured by numbers of students qualifying for free or reduced cost lunch programs). The data gathered from all of these evaluative studies has proven instrumental in developing an understanding of who come to Courage to Teach Programs, why they come and what they believe they take away from participation in Courage to Teach retreats.

APPENDIX B

Current and Continuing Research Efforts on

Courage to Teach and Teacher Formation

Continuing Research Efforts:

Currently there are several other studies in process across the nation that both

seek to duplicate the studies already completed as well as expand the inquiry process

surrounding the Courage to Teach programs as well as the theory, principals and

practices of Teacher Formation. Below is a selected list of those studies:

Secondary Academic Studies:

Michael Downey	This study will focus on the role of spirituality in schools and particularly on the role of spritually in the classroom in Australia.
Gloria Fleming	This study focus primarily on the role of spirituality in the context of adult education settings. The focus of this study is both teachers and students in Adult Learning roles. The study draws heavily on the work of Dr. Parker Palmer and the emerging theory of Teacher Formation. University of Georgia, expected date of completion, 2005

Primary Academic Studies:

David Henderson	This study will be a participant ethnography of participation in a Courage to Teach program.

Evaluative Studies:

Washington State Courage to Teach Colleagues Project:

A survey base study of colleagues and supervisors of Courage to Teach
participants designed to identify and articulate changes in professional practice
observed in CTT program participants over the course of a retreat series.

Pre and Post Surveys of Participants in Washington State Courage to Teach
programs for 2003-2004.

A survey based study that duplicates the Poutiatine 2002, 2003a, and 2003b
efforts. This survey is focused on self report data concerning: 1) who comes to
WaCTT programs; 2) why participants come to CTT programs in Washington
State; 3) what participants believe they will get out of their participation and; 4)

what participants state they actually get out of their participation in WaCTT seasonal retreat programs.

APPENDIX C

Recommendations for Future Study of Courage to Teach

and the Theory, Process and Practice of Teacher Formation

The current state of research on Courage to Teach specifically, and Teacher Formation in general, implies several interesting avenues for further research. The first of which is to continue the focus already in progress on the outcomes and impacts of Teacher Formation programming on teachers and classrooms. The research to date offers some specific observable outcomes from participation in Courage to Teach programs, but understanding how these outcomes manifest in specific teachers and in specific vocational contexts is only just beginning to take shape. Both primary research studies and evaluative work on how individuals conceptualize the impacts their participation in Courage programming would further refine and direct our understanding of the impacts and outcomes of this work. To date research of this nature has been almost exclusively self-reported by participants. In the future research designs and methods for collecting data that correlates the report of participants with observations of others in school communities could prove to broaden and deepen the existing research base considerably.

Another area that shows great promise for further research is the area of school organizational culture. There are several areas of concentration in the nation now where a significant number of teachers and educational leaders have participated in Courage programs (e.g. Shoreline School District in Washington State and Winnetka School District in Illinois). This phenomenon begs the question, how does Teacher Formation impact divisions within schools, whole schools or even whole school districts, when a number of teachers in the same context have been exposed to Teacher Formation.

A third area for exploration is that of the impact Courage to Teach has on students indirectly. While Courage to Teach is quite specific that there are no articulated outcomes as far as students are concerned from teachers' participation in Courage programs, there are clearly some outcomes that affect students. Common sense coupled with the sporadic secondary research that connects some of the documented outcomes of participation in Courage to Teach programs may imply that students' classroom experiences would

change as a result of their teacher's participation in Courage programming, but as of yet no research has been conducted in this direction.

Another area that offers research promise is in the connection of existing data based practices and Courage to Teach programming. For example, in the Poutiatine 2003a and 2003b evaluative studies of Courage to Teach participants a significant number of the respondents stated that their participation in Courage to Teach increased their relational trust capacity in their colleagues and supervisors in their schools. The Byrk and Schneider study of trust in schools (2002) detailed strong correlations between institutional trust capacity and student achievement on standardized tests. This kind of research can help to direct and support educator development in terms of existing data based best practice knowledge.

As the understanding of the theory and practice of Teacher Formation grows, the need for quality research to test and expand this understanding also grows. Nationally movement in the field of teacher development continues to underscore the need for the development of data based models of teacher development that offer a more integrated and holistic vision for teaching. Courage to Teach clearly provides significant opportunities to explore some of the principles and practices that can provide the foundation for some these new models.

REFERENCES

Ayres, W. (1987). Introduction to part III. In F. S. Bolin & J. M. Falk (Eds.), *Teacher Renewal: Professional issues, personal choices* (pp. 89-92). New York: Teachers College Press.

Ayers, W. (Ed.). (1995). *To become a teacher*. New York: Teachers College Press.

Ayers, W. (2001). *To teach: The journey of a teacher*. New York: Teachers College Press.

Barth, R. S. (1990). *Improving schools from within*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Barth, R. S. (2001). *Learning by heart*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Bolin, F. S., & Falk, J. M. (Eds.). (1987). *Teacher renewal: Professional issues, personal choices* . New York: Teachers College Press.

Brookfield, S. D. (1995). *Becoming a critically reflective teacher*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Bryk, A. S., & Schneider, B. (2002). *Trust in schools*. New York: Russell Sage Foundation.

Caine, M. & Caine, G. (1990). *Making connections: Teaching and the human brain*. Alexandria, VA: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development

Carotta, C. C. (1999). *Sustaining a vocation: Adaptive challenges and proposed practices*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Spalding University, Louisville, KY.

Center for Teacher Formation. (2005). *Courage to Teach* [Web Page]. URL http://www.teacherformation.org/index.cfm [2005, July 21].

Clark, C. H. (1992). Teachers as designers in self-directed professional development. In A. Hargreaves & M. G. Fullen (Eds.), *Understanding teacher development* (pp. 75-84). New York: Teachers College Press.

Clark, C. M. (1995). *Thoughtful teaching*. New York: Cassell.

Collinson, V. (1994). *Teachers as learners*. San Francisco: Austin and Winfield.

Collinson, V. (1996). *Reaching students: Teachers' ways of knowing*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Corwin.

Coombs, A. W. (1965). *The professional education of teachers*. Boston: Allyn and Bacon.

Coombs, A. W., Blume, R. A., Newman, A. J., & Wass, H. L. (1974). *The professional education of teachers: Second edition.* Boston: Allyn and Bacon.

Coward, R. H. (2003). *Teacher renewal and commitment to education: A qualitative analysis of teachers' experiences at the North Carolina Center for the Advancement of Teaching (NCCAT).* Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Western Carolina University, Cullowhee, NC.

Danielewicz, J. (2001). *Teaching selves: Identity, pedagogy, and teacher education.* Albany, NY: State University of New York Press.

Dantonio, M. & Beisenherz, P.C. (2000). *Learning to question: Questioning to learn*. Boston: Allyn and Bacon.

Darling-Hammond, L. (Ed.). (1994). *Professional development schools*. New York: Teachers College Press.

Darling-Hammond, L. (1997). *The right to learn: A blueprint for creating schools that work*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Darling-Hammond, L., & Sykes, G. (Eds.). (1999). *Teaching as the learning profession*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Farkas, S., Johnson, J. & Foley, P. (2000). *A sense of calling: Who teaches and why.* New York: Public Agenda, http://www.publicagenda.org/specials/teachers/.htm

Faulkner, A. (2003). *Evaluation of Courage to Teach Program - Texas.* Bainbridge Island, WA: Center for Teacher Formation.

Fullan, M., & Hargreaves, A. (Eds.). (1992). *Teacher development and educational change.* Washington, D.C.: Falmer.

Fullan, M., & Hargreaves, A. (1996). *What's worth fighting for in your school*. New York: Teachers College Press.

Gardner, J. W. (1963). *Self-renewal: The individual and the innovative society.* New York: W. W. Norton.

Grimmett, P., & Crehan, P. (1992). The nature of collegiality in teacher development: The case for clinical supervision. In M. Fullan & A. Hargreaves (Eds.), *Teacher development and educational change* (pp. 56-85). London: Falmer.

Grimmett, P. P., & MacKinnon, A. M. (1992). Craft knowledge and the education of teachers. In G. Grant (Ed.), *Review of research in teacher education* (pp. 385-456). Washington, DC: American Educational Research Association.

Grimmet, P. P., & Neufeld, J. (Eds.). (1994). *Teacher development and the struggle for authenticity*. New York: Teachers College Press.

Goodlad, J. I. (1994). *Educational renewal.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Hansen, D. T. (1995). *The call to teach.* New York: Teachers College Press.

Hansen, D. T. (2001). *Exploring the moral heart of teaching.* New York: Teachers College Press.

Hargreaves, A. (1992). Cultures of teaching. In A. Hargreaves & M. Fullen (Eds.), *Understanding teacher development.* New York: Teachers College Press.

Hargreaves, A. (1994). *Changing teachers, changing times.* New York: Teachers College Press.

Hargreaves, A., & Fullan, M. G. (1992). *Understanding teacher development.* New York: Teachers College Press.

Hargreaves, A., & Fullan, M. (1996). *What's worth fighting for out there.* New York: Teachers College Press.

Hamachek, D. (1999). Effective teachers: What they do, how they do it and the importance of self-knowledge. In R. P. Lipka & T. M. Brinthaupt (Eds.), *The role of the self in teacher development* (pp. 189-224). Albany, NY: State University of New York.

Huberman, M. (1992). Teacher development and instructional mastery. In A. Hargreaves & M. Fullan (Eds.), *Understanding teacher development* (pp. 112-142). New York: Teachers College Press.

Huberman, M. (1993). J. Neufeld (Trans.), *The lives of teachers* . New York: Teachers College Press.

Intrator, S., & Scribner, M. (1998). *An evaluation of the Courage to Teach program.* Bainbridge Island, WA: Center for Teacher Formation.

Intrator, S., & Scribner, M. (2000). *A Longitudinal Program Evaluation of the Courage to Teach program.* Bainbridge Island, WA: Center for Teacher Formation.

Intrator S. (2004) *The Heart of Teaching: Making the Connection Between Teaching and Inner Life*. Speech delivered to International Step by Step Association annual meeting in Budapest, Hungary; November 8-10.

Intrator, S. M. (2002). *Stories of the courage to teach: Honoring the teacher's heart.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Jackson, P. W. (1990). *Life in classrooms.* New York: Teachers College Press.

Jay, J. K. (2003). *Quality teaching: Reflection as the heart of practice.* Lanham, MY: The Scarecrow Press.

Jensen, E. (1998). *Teaching with the brain in mind*. Alexandria, VA: The Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development.

Jensen, E. (2000). *Brain based learning.* San Diego, CA: The Brain Store.

Jersild, A. T. (1952). *In search of self.* New York: Teachers College Press.

Jersild, A. T. (1955). *When teachers face themselves.* New York: Teachers College Press.

Joyce, B. (1975). Conceptions of man and their implications for teacher education. In K. Ryan (Ed.), *Teacher education: The seventy-fourth yearbook of the National Society for the Study of Education* (pp. 111-145). Chicago, University of Chicago Press.

Kohl, H. (1967). *36 children.* New York: Penguin Books.

Kohn, A. (1999). *The schools our children deserve.* New York: Houghton Mifflin.

Korthagen, F. A. (2001). *Linking practice and theory: The pedagogy of realistic teacher education.* Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Korthagen, F. (2004). In search of the essence of a good teacher: Towards a more holistic approach in teacher education. *Teaching and Teacher Education, 2004*(20), 77-97.

Korthagen, F. & Vasalos, A. (2005). Levels in reflection: Core reflection as a means to enhance professional growth. *Teachers and Teaching: Theory and Practice, 11*(1), Feb. 2005, 47-71.

Lieberman, A. (1994). Teacher development: Commitment and challenge. In P. Grimmett, & J. Neufeld (Eds.), *Teacher development and the struggle for authenticity* (pp. 15-30). New York: Teachers College Press.

Lipka, R. P., & Brinthaupt, T. M. (Eds.). (1999). *The role of self in teacher development.* Albany, NY: State University of New York Press.

Livsey, R. C., & Palmer, P. (1999). *The courage to teach: A guide for reflection and renewal.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Lortie, D. C. (1975). *Schoolteacher: A sociological study.* Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.

McMahon, L. G. (2003). *Rekindling the spirit to teach: A qualitative study of the personal and professional renewal of teachers.* Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Gonzaga University, Spokane, WA.

Mysliwiec, M. A. (1997). *Creating a handbook for principals seeing ideas for teacher renewal.* Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Columbia University, New York.

National Board of Professional Teaching Standards. (2003). *NBPTS Policy Statement, Five Core Propositions* [Web Page]. URL http://www.nbpts.org/standards/index.cfm [2003, July 21].

National Commission on Teaching and America's Future. (1996). *What Matters Most.* http://zuni.k12.nm.us/Ias/21TE/NWREL/what.htm.

Palmer, P. J. (1998). *The courage to teach: Exploring the inner landscape of a teacher's life*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Poutiatine, M. (2002). *Data analysis of Courage to Teach Teachers Surveys: Fall 2001.* Bainbridge Island, WA: Center for Teacher Formation.

Poutiatine, M. (2003a). *Data analysis of teachers pre-participation surveys: Fall 2002.* Bainbridge Island, WA: Center for Teacher Formation.

Poutiatine, M. (2003b). *Data analysis of Courage to Teach Teachers' Post Participation Survey: 2001-2003*. Bainbridge Island, WA: Center for Teacher Formation.

Poutiatine, M. I. (2005*). The role of identity and integrity in teacher development: Towards a grounded theory of Teacher Formation..* Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Gonzaga University, Spokane, WA.

Pressley, C. A. (1992). *The impact of teacher renewal seminars on classroom practice: A case study of selected participants of the North Carolina Center for the Advancement of Teaching.* Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of North Carolina at Greensboro, Greensboro, NC.

Senge et al., P., Cambron-McCabe, N., Lucas, T., Smith, B., Dutton, J., & Kleiner, A. (2000). *Schools that learn.* New York: Doubleday.

Senge et al., P., Scharmer, C. O., Jaworski, J., & Flowers, B. S. (2004). *Presence: Human   purpose and the field of the future.* Cambridge, MA: Society for Organizational Learning.

Sergiovanni, T. J. (1994). *Building community in schools.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Sergiovanni, T. J. (2000). *The lifeworld of leadership.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Schon, D. A. (1983). *The reflective practitioner.* Basic Books.

Schon, D. A. (1987). *Educating the reflective practitioner.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Simone, G. (2004*). Professional development as a process of renewal: Case studies of the Courage to Teach program.* Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Colorado at Boulder, Boulder, CO.

Sizer, T. R. (1992a). *Horace's compromise.* New York: Houghton Mifflin.

Sizer, T. R. (1992b). *Horace's school*. New York: Houghton Mifflin.

Tickle, L. (1999). Teacher self-appraisal and appraisal of self. In R. P. Lipka & T. M. Brinthaupt (Eds.), *The role of self in teacher development* (pp. 121-141). Albany, NY: State University of New York Press

Tschammen-Moran, M. (2004) Trust *matters: Leadership for successful schools*. New York: John Wiley & Sons.

Whitlock, N. A. (2003). *A conceptual framework for teacher renewal.* Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Spalding University, Louisville, KY.